

Examples of Collation Errors in *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian*

Jingjing Xu

School of Law, Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou, China
Email: xujj@vip.163.com

How to cite this paper: Xu, J. J. (2025). Examples of Collation Errors in *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian*. *Open Journal of Social Sciences*, 13, 616-628.
<https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2025.1311038>

Received: October 23, 2025
Accepted: November 23, 2025
Published: November 26, 2025

Copyright © 2025 by author(s) and Scientific Research Publishing Inc.
This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY 4.0).
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>



Open Access

Abstract

Chang Jian was a famous poet of the High Tang period, with few surviving poems—Song dynasty printed editions contain only fifty-seven poems. In 2017, Zhonghua Book Company published *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian*, compiled by Wang Xijiu, which takes the Jiajing 33 (1554) Fuyushan Fang woodblock edition by Huang Guanzeng as its base text and collates fourteen sources, becoming the standard edition of Chang Jian's collected poems. The author of this article re-examined the base text and nine collated editions and discovered numerous errors in the collation work, totaling over one hundred items. Particularly noteworthy is the “Wang edition” cited in the collation: contrary to the compiled edition's implication, it is not a Ming printed edition but a Qing manuscript copy. Among Chang Jian's fifty-eight poems, only eleven show no errors. Problem types include failure to collate, erroneous collation, omission of collation, and spurious collation, involving misinterpretation of character forms, omission of variant readings, errors in collation notes, and fabrication of edition annotations. This article discusses the observed errors in four parts according to textual lineages: 1) Base text errors; 2) Song printed edition (Song woodblock edition, Lin'an edition) errors; 3) Ming-Qing transmission edition (Bi edition, Mao edition, Wang edition, movable-type edition) errors; 4) External collation source (*Tang Wencui*, *Wenyuan Yinghua*, *Complete Tang Poems*) errors. Each item notes the poem title, characters and lines, textual variants and page numbers by edition, with analysis. This article aims to correct errors in the original book and provide reliable textual evidence for the academic community.

Keywords

Chang Jian, *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian*, Textual Criticism, Classical Text Compilation, Zhonghua Book Company

1. Introduction

Chang Jian was a famous Tang dynasty poet, yet few of his poems survive. Song dynasty printed editions contain only fifty-seven poems; Ming-Qing printed editions sometimes include the additional poem “Wugugong” (Ji, 2019), but this is not by Chang Jian (Tong, 1996: p. 108). Wang Xijiu’s *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian* was published by Zhonghua Book Company in 2017, collating fourteen sources. The book’s general principles state: “Where the base text and collated editions have variant readings, all are recorded in collation notes” (Wang, 2017: p 2). Ye Dehui said in *Ten Principles of Book Collection*: “A book without collation might as well not be read” (Ye, 1957: p. 50). Following this principle, I re-examined the base text and nine of the collated editions and discovered errors, omissions, and spurious entries in the collation. These are now explained in three parts according to textual lineages. To avoid confusion, this article uses the same abbreviations as *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian*, noting in parentheses the page numbers in that edition. Furthermore, since most errors are failures to collate, such cases only note the variant readings without further elaboration (Xu, 2014).

This article is divided into four sections. The first section re-examines the base text, Chang Jian Ji, identifying one error in the collated edition, though all character forms in the base text were altered. The second section compares it with the Song dynasty edition, revealing 39 errors in the collated edition. The third section collates it against Ming and Qing transmitted editions (Bi edition, Mao edition, Wang edition, and movable-type edition), identifying 52 errors in the collated edition. The fourth section compares it with other collated texts (Tang Wen Cui, Wen Yuan Yinghua, and Quan Tang Shi) (Peng, 1960), noting 16 errors in the collated edition. Each error is documented with the poem title, text, textual variants across editions, page numbers, and accompanied by detailed analysis.

2. Methods

This article employs traditional textual criticism methods, referencing Chen Yuan’s “Four Methods of Textual Criticism” to evaluate the reliability of Wang Xijiu’s Annotations and Collations of Chang Jian’s Poetry (Chen, 2010). It re-examines the base text, the Ming Jiajing 33rd year (1554) Huang Guanzeng Fuyushanfang edition, and collates it against nine other editions, including the Song dynasty edition, Lin’an edition, Ming and Qing Bi edition, Mao edition, Wang edition, movable-type edition, as well as Tang Wen Cui, Wen Yuan Yinghua, and Quan Tang Shi. The analysis reveals issues in the original collation, including omissions, erroneous collations, missing collations, and redundant collations, encompassing errors in character interpretation, unrecorded variant readings, inaccuracies in collation notes, and fabricated annotations. Over one hundred errors were identified.

3. Base Text

Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian takes as its base text the *Chang Jian ji* from *Twenty-Six Tang Poets* printed at Fuyushan Fang by Huang Guanzeng in Jiajing 33 (1554). This edition has ten lines per half-page, with nineteen characters per line, occasionally twenty characters. Re-examining the base text now, the compiled edition has few errors, with only one misreading.

1) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, the character *bei* 背 in “zhuai ce bei luo ri” originally appears as 皆 in the base text, missing its final stroke. Examining the four copies of *Twenty-Six Tang Poets* held at the National Library, the character 皆 uniformly lacks its final stroke (*Twenty-Six Poets of the Tang Dynasty*), confirming that the compiled edition mistakenly reads it as 背.

However, the compiled edition frequently alters character forms from the base text. Some alterations are inherent to classical text compilation and facilitate reading, such as changing 樹 to 树, 羣 to 群, 鬢 to 髮, 昏 to 昏, 喪 to 丧, 邊 to 边, 雙 to 双, 鎖 to 锁, 寤寐 to 寤寐, 恠 to 怪, 往 to 往, 戲 to 戏, etc. However, some alterations may be unnecessary, such as changing 歎 to 叹, 煉 to 炼, 裊裊 and 裊裊 to 裊裊, 棹 to 棹, 鋤 to 锄, 粧 to 妆, 碁 to 棋, 飡 to 餐, 昇 to 升, 蹤 to 踪, 棲 to 栖, 蜚 to 蛰, 託 to 托, 豕 to 豕, 汎 to 泛, 暫 to 暂, 俛 to 俯, 鬪 to 斗, 肴 to 肴, 弔 to 吊, 鄰 to 邻, 驃 to 嫖, 猿 to 猿, 寇 to 寇, 盪 to 荡, etc.—these are not exhaustively listed.

4. Song Printed Editions

For Chang Jian’s poetry collection, two Song printed editions are extant today. One is the Song woodblock *Chang Jian ji* held at the National Library, abbreviated as Song woodblock edition, which the compiled edition collated using the *Zhonghua Reproductions of Rare Books* facsimile. The second is the *Chang Jian ji* held at the National Palace Museum in Taipei, with “Printed by the Chen residence, south of Muqin Lane, North Shed Street, Lin’an Prefecture” carved at the end of the volume, hence abbreviated as Lin’an edition. Originally part of the Qing imperial collection, it is catalogued in *Sequel to the Catalogue of Tianlu Linlang* (Peng, 2002, pp. 197-198). In the 20th year of the Republic (1931), it was reproduced in the *Tianlu Linlang Series*, which the compiled edition used for collation. The *Preface and Catalogue of the Tianlu Linlang Series* states: “The division into juan and arrangement of poems differ from Ming and later printed editions, and this Chang Wei collection should be considered the most ancient. The original printing was extremely fine, but unfortunately severely damaged by insects. Therefore, we borrowed the copy from Mr. Zhou of Jiande and had skilled craftsmen trace the missing characters, completing the photographic reproduction so it could be read.” (*Palace Museum*, 1931: p. 3). Thus, the facsimile has supplemented strokes, leaving no blurred or damaged characters, and has slight differences from the Song woodblock edition in taboo avoidance and character forms.

The two editions have basically the same format, except that the Song woodblock

edition has some blurred or damaged characters. Apart from places that cannot be verified due to this, there is only one variant in “Failing the Examination in Chang’an”—the character 家 in “jiayuan haozai shang liu Qin” appears as 东 in the Song woodblock edition and as 家 in the Lin’an edition. Therefore, the following list of errors generally discusses both editions together.

1) In “Seeing Off Lu Zhuo”, the character 盘 in “Lu sheng he kao pan” appears as 盘 in both editions. (Page 1)

2) In “Seeing Off Lu Zhuo”, the phrase “yinqin tan” in “yinqin tan gu feng” appears as “殷懃叹” in both editions. (Page 1)

3) In “Clear Evening on the Lake”, the character 睹 in “you du huanying shi” appears as 覩 in both editions. (Page 17)

4) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, the character 清 in “qing xi shen bu ce” appears as 青 in both editions. (Page 22)

5) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, the character 亭 in “mao ting su hua ying” appears as 庭 in both editions. (Page 22)

6) In “To Junior Clerk Song Chu”, the character 明 in “han ying ming qian chu” appears as 流 in the Lin’an edition. (Page 37)

7) In “Zhang the Daoist Playing the Qin”, for the character 其 in “qi jiang lian jin ding”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Song woodblock edition reads 共. Examining the Song woodblock edition now, it reads 共, but the character form is quite similar to 其, merely lacking the two middle horizontal strokes. Further examining other instances of the character 共 in the Song woodblock edition, such as in the lines “fan fu gu gong ran” in “At Ezhou Summoning Wang Changling and Zhang Fen”, “gu lai jie gong nan” in “Presented to the Three Censors”, “huai ren sui gong an” in “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, “jun chen jie gong yi” in “Lamenting the Duke of Tai’s Late Recognition”, and “gong hen dan qing ren” in “Tomb of Wang Zhaojun”, the character 共 in all these instances differs in form from this 共. Moreover, the Lin’an edition belongs to the same textual family as the Song woodblock edition and also does not read 共 but actually reads 其. Considering all evidence together, this proves it is the character 其 damaged to resemble 共, not its original appearance. (Page 42)

8) In “White Lake Monastery, the Back Stream, Lodging at Cloud Gate”, in the line “qian zhan wang cheng cu”, the Song woodblock edition has a note under the character 王: “Alternative reading: 去.” (Page 47)

9) In “Idle Study, Ill in Bed, Walking with Medicine to the Mountain Lodge, Then to the Lake Pavilion, Two Poems”, poem two, the character 漫 in “lan man cong tian ya” appears as 漫 in both editions. (Page 57)

10) In “Dreaming of the Western Peak of Mount Taibai”, the character 氲 in “yan lin bi yin yun” appears as 氛 in the Song woodblock edition. (Page 75)

11) In “At Ezhou Summoning Wang Changling and Zhang Fen”, the character 氲 in “xi jian hua yin yun” appears as 氛 in the Song woodblock edition. (Page 81)

12) In “Ancient Sentiment”, the character 沓 in “he ta sheng chen wu” appears as 沓 in both editions. (Page 96)

13) In “Western Mountain”, the character 至 in “zhi ye zhuan qing jiong” appears as 其 in the Lin’an edition. (Page 102)

14) In “The Third Peak”, the character 缈 in “piaomiao qing xia rong” appears as 眇 in the Lin’an edition. (Page 121)

15) In “The Third Peak”, the character 暝 in “shan ming xue qi niao” appears as 暝 (with slightly different character forms) in both editions. (Page 121)

16) In “The Third Peak”, the phrase 袅袅 in “niaoniao yun xi zhong” appears as 袅袅 in both editions, and 钟 appears as 钟 in the Lin’an edition. (Page 121) Additionally, the character alteration 袅袅 also appears in “A Guest Returned from Yan, Lamenting His Old Age, Presented to Him”, in the line “niaoniao chi bai tian” (Page 136), “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, “niaoniao chi diao gan” (Page 205), and “Playfully Inscribed at the Lake”, “zhu gan niaoniao bo wu ji” (Page 300).

17) In “A Guest Returned from Yan, Lamenting His Old Age, Presented to Him”, the character 冢 in “yi qin bai gu zhong” appears as 冢 in both editions. (Page 136)

18) In “A Guest Returned from Yan, Lamenting His Old Age, Presented to Him”, the character 惟 in “yu kou wei Chaoxian” appears as 唯 in both editions. (Page 136)

19) In “Celestial Master Zhang’s Thatched Hall”, for “sui deng xian zi gu, yin zui tian sheng zun”, the characters 仙, 谷, and 醉, the compiled edition’s collation notes all state they appear as “口” in both editions, but both editions actually have ink nail fillers. (Page 146)

20) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, the character 土 in “tu su bu shang nong” appears as 士 in both editions. (Page 167)

21) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, the character 肴 in “cai wei ke wei yao” appears as 肴 in both editions. (Page 167)

22) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, for the character 归 in “qi ren gui niao chao”, 言 in “yan yu jie ya yao”, 禽兽 in “mo yao she qin shou”, and 敬 in “jing jun zhong guo lai”, the compiled edition’s collation notes all state the Song woodblock edition reads “口”. Examining the Song woodblock edition now, the four characters 归, 言, 禽, and 敬 are damaged in the printing block, not reading “口”. Moreover, in the line “mo yao she qin shou”, the character 射 is damaged, while 兽 remains intact—the collation note is in error. (Page 167)

23) In “Lamenting the Duke of Tai’s Late Recognition”, the character 曜 in “xuan gai yao chang kui” appears as 曜 in both editions. (Page 172)

24) In “Lament for General Wang’s Tomb”, the character 强 in “shen ru qiang qian li” appears as 强 in the Song woodblock edition. (Page 187)

25) In “Ancient Poem”, the character 彩 in “xian ren qi feng pi cai xia” appears as 彩 in both editions. (Page 197)

26) In “Ancient Sentiments”, the character 成 in “zhi cheng jin qin dang wei shei”, the compiled edition’s collation note states it originally read 女 and was emended based on the Song woodblock edition and five other editions. Examining

the Song woodblock edition now, it actually reads 女, not 成, and the Lin'an edition also reads 女. (Page 201)

27) In “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, for the character 北 in “zhuan zhan gu jun xi hai bei”, the Song woodblock edition has a note below 北: “Alternative reading: 曲.” (Page 205)

28) In “Inscribed at the Back Chan Cloister of Broken Mountain Monastery”, the character 钟 in “dan yu zhong qing yin” appears as 钟 in both editions. (Page 209)

29) In “Seeing Off Li, Grand Protector”, the character 下 in “jun zhi mu xia mi” appears as 中 in the Lin'an edition. (Page 241)

30) In “Mooring at Xuyi”, the character 淮 in “bo zhou Huai shui ci” appears as 睢 in the Lin'an edition. (Page 250)

31) In “Failing the Examination in Chang'an”, the character 家 in “jiayuan haozai shang liu Qin” appears as 东 in the Song woodblock edition, but the upper part of 东 is supplemented strokes and may not reflect its original appearance. (Page 267)

32) In “Inscribed at the Court Monastery”, the character 皎 in “jiao yue dian zhong san du qing” appears as 皓 in the Lin'an edition. (Page 274)

33) In “Inscribed at the Court Monastery”, the character 晶 in “shui jing gong li yi seng chan” appears as 精 in both editions. (Pages 274-275)

34) In “On the Third Day Seeking Li Jiu's Estate”, the character 荡 in “yonghe san ri dang qing zhou” appears as 荡 in both editions. (Page 279)

Note: The above 34 items involve failures to record collation, omissions, and so forth. Some characters are interchangeable, such as 盪 and 盪 in item 1, and need not be noted in collation. However, Song editions are rare, and collation should preserve their original forms, not confuse ancient editions on grounds of interchangeability.

5. Ming-Qing Transmission Editions

The Bi edition, Mao edition, Wang edition, and movable-type edition are Ming-Qing transmission editions of Chang Jian's poems.

5.1. Bi Edition

The Bi edition is the abbreviated name for *Ten Poets of the Tang*, held at Nanjing Library. Collation errors in the compiled edition regarding this edition include:

1) In “Seeing Off Lu Zhuo”, the character 呶 in “yinqin tan gu feng” appears as 劝 in the Bi edition. Note: the character 劝 is slightly smaller, seemingly later scraped and altered. (Page 1)

2) In “Qin Inspiration on the River”, for the character 梧 in “shi zhi wutong zhi”, the Bi edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 枯.” (Page 10)

3) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, the character 惟 in “qi wei qiu zhong shang” appears as 唯 in the Bi edition. (Page 42)

4) In “In the Immortal Valley Meeting the Mao Maiden, Understanding She

Was a Qin Palace Woman”, the character 玉 in “qian sui wei yu tong” appears as 王 in the Bi edition. This may be due to printing block damage. (Page 66)

5) In “At Ezhou Summoning Wang Changling and Zhang Fen”, the character 花 in “xi jian hua yin yun” appears as 何 in the Bi edition. (Page 81)

6) In “Ancient Sentiments”, the character 魄 in “jing po jin he zhi” appears as 魂 in the Bi edition. (Pages 127-128) Also, the character 偏 in “pian guan jin shi ren” appears as 徧 in the Bi edition. (Page 128)

7) In “Playing the Zither at Night in a High Tower”, for the character 由 in “qu du you wei zhong”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Bi edition reads 犹. Examining the Bi edition now, it actually agrees with the base text reading 由, not 犹. (Page 132)

8) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, the character 归 in “qi ren gui niao chao” appears as 居 in the Bi edition. (Page 167)

9) In “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, the character 悬 in “yao jian xuan lulu” appears as 县 in the Bi edition. (Page 205)

10) In “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, the character 嫖 in “chu men shi piao yao” appears as 骠 in the Bi edition. Note: 嫖姚 and 骠姚 are the same. (Page 205)

5.2. Mao Edition

The Mao edition is the abbreviated name for *Six Famous Tang Poets*, held at Nanjing Library. Its errors are as follows:

1) In “Seeing Off Lu Zhuo”, for the character 俊 in “sheng dai duo cai jun”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 秀.” (Page 1)

2) In “In the Immortal Valley Meeting the Mao Maiden, Understanding She Was a Qin Palace Woman”, the character 弥 in “mi man chang tian kong” appears as 弥 in the Mao edition. (Page 66)

3) In “Dreaming of the Western Peak of Mount Taibai”, for the character 峰 in “yi wo Taibai feng”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 岑.” (Page 75)

4) In “Dreaming of the Western Peak of Mount Taibai”, for the character 水 in “shi wang xi shui jian”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 谷.” (Page 75)

5) In “Two Spring Poems”, poem one, for the character 对 in “yi dui chun guang chi”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 树.” For the character 光, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 风.” (Page 87)

6) In “On the Eve of the Last Day at Horse-Stirrups Bend, Then Moving to Midstream”, for the character 秦 in “Qin tian wu xian yi”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 晴.” (Page 91)

7) In “On the Eve of the Last Day at Horse-Stirrups Bend, Then Moving to Midstream”, for the character 因 in “yin chang Canglang yin”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 同.” (Page 92)

8) In “Presented to the Three Censors”, for the character 甚 in “ming jun cuo shen cai”, the base text reads 认, the Mao edition reads 甚; the Mao edition

should be listed in the collation notes. (Page 114)

9) In “Celestial Master Zhang’s Thatched Hall”, for the character 便 in “xin hua bian wu ying”, the Mao edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 更.” (Page 146)

10) In “Konglingshan: In Response to Elder Tian”, the character 归 in “qi ren gui niao chao” appears as 居 in the Mao edition. (Page 167)

11) In “Tomb of Wang Zhaojun”, for the character 馱 in “wan li tuo huang jin”, the base text reads 驼, the Mao edition reads 馱; 馱 and 馱 are the same, so the Mao edition should be listed in the collation notes. (Page 178)

12) In “Lament for General Wang’s Tomb”, the character 强 in “shen ru qiang qian li” appears as 强 in the Mao edition. (Page 187)

5.3. Wang Edition

The Wang edition is the abbreviated name for *Ten Disciples of the Tang* compiled by Wang Zhun in the dingwei year of Jiajing (Ming), held at Nanjing Library. However, the Nanjing Library copy is actually a Qing dynasty Tao family Sheyuan traced copy of the Ming Jiajing edition. The compiled edition mistakenly treats this Qing traced copy as a Ming Jiajing edition; *Comprehensive Catalogue of Chinese Classics* also records it as “Guangxu 33 (Qing) Tao family Sheyuan traced copy.”

1) In “Qin Inspiration on the River”, for the character 阴 in “wan mu cheng you yin”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 音.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 10)

2) In “Clear Evening on the Lake”, for the character 乘 in “yan cheng xing han ming”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 垂.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 17)

3) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, for the character 测 in “qing xi shen bu ce”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 极.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 23)

4) In “To Junior Clerk Song Chu”, for the character 明 in “han ying ming qian chu”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 流.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 37)

5) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, for the character 清 in “shan ling wen qing yin”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 幽.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 43)

6) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, for the character 气 in “liao ran yun xia qi”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 意.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 43)

7) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, for the character 扣 in “gai xian kou shang sheng”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 和.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 43)

8) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, for the character 矣 in “yong yi tou wu zan”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 以.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 43)

9) In “Idle Study, Ill in Bed, Walking with Medicine to the Mountain Lodge, Then to the Lake Pavilion, Two Poems”, poem one, for the character 虚 in “xin hun wei xu shi”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 灵.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 54)

10) In “Song of the Frontier”, the character 太 in “lai wen Taiyuan zu” appears as 大 in the Wang edition. (Page 61)

11) In “In the Immortal Valley Meeting the Mao Maiden, Understanding She Was a Qin Palace Woman”, for the character 流 in “qian liu shu wei qiong”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 临.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 66)

12) In “Two Spring Poems”, poem two, for the character 为 in “fei dan wei can ji”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition reads 畏 and has a note: “Alternative reading: 为.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 89)

13) In “On the Eve of the Last Day at Horse-Stirrups Bend, Then Moving to Midstream”, for the character 秦 in “qin tian wu xian yi”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 晴.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 91)

14) In “Western Mountain”, for the character 衣 in “bai lu zhan ren yi”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 袂.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 102)

15) In “Playing the Zither at Night in a High Tower”, for the character 由 in “qu du you wei zhong”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition reads 犹. Examining the Wang edition now, it actually agrees with the base text reading 由, not 犹. (Page 132)

16) In “Celestial Master Zhang’s Thatched Hall”, for the character 生 in “yin zui tian sheng zun”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 中.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 146)

17) In “Celestial Master Zhang’s Thatched Hall”, for the character 便 in “xin hua bian wu ying”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 更.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 146)

18) In “Celestial Master Zhang’s Thatched Hall”, for the character 与 in “hu er yu xiao han”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has

a note: “Alternative reading: 举.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 146)

19) In “Tomb of Wang Zhaojun”, for the phrase 伤独 in “yi yu shang du mo”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 犹伤.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 178)

20) In “Lament for General Wang’s Tomb”, the character 强 in “shen ru qiang qian li” appears as 强 in the Wang edition, and the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 几.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 187)

21) In “Ancient Sentiments”, for the character 成 in “zhi cheng jin qin dang wei shei”, the compiled edition’s collation note states it originally read 女 and was emended based on the Wang edition and five other editions. Examining the Wang edition now, it actually reads 女, not 成. (Page 201)

22) In “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note below the title: “Alternative reading: Ancient Poem.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 205)

23) In “Zhang Gongzi Xing”, for the phrase 侠客 in “xia ke bai yun zhong”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 使君.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 205)

24) In “Inscribed at the Back Chan Cloister of Broken Mountain Monastery”, for the character 通 in “zhu jing tong you chu”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 遇.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 209)

25) In “Autumn Night Listening to the Qin, Presented to Master Kou”, for the character 急 in “han chong lin qi ji”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition reads 默 and has a note: “Alternative reading: 急.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 246)

26) In “On the Frontier”, for the phrase 遁旌 in “zuo xian wei dun jing gan zhe”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 斩旌.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 270)

27) In “Playfully Inscribed at the Lake”, for the character 矾 in “hu shang lao ren zuo ji tou”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 岛.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 300)

28) In “Playfully Inscribed at the Lake”, for the phrase 波无 in “zhu gan niao niao bo wu ji”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Wang edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 白波.” Examining the Wang edition now, there is no such note. (Page 300)

The edition actually employed may not have been the one claimed by the book itself—namely, the Ming Jiajing Dingwei (1547) Tang Shizi Shi compiled by Wang

Zhun—but rather another text altogether, resulting in a case of mistaken attribution. It is highly probable that, during the collation process, factors such as division of labor led different contributors to consult varying editions; when these were forcibly harmonized in the final compilation, significant discrepancies arose between the cited editions and the textual evidence.

5.4. Movable-Type Edition

In “Lament for General Wang’s Tomb”, the character 强 in “shen ru qiang qian li” appears as 强 in the movable-type edition. (Page 187)

6. External Collation Sources

The three works *Tang Wencui*, *Wenyuan Yinghua*, and *Complete Tang Poems* include Chang Jian’s poems and are abbreviated respectively as Wencui edition, Yinghua edition, and Quan edition. Chen Yuan said in *Examples in Textual Criticism*: “The method of external collation means using other books to collate the book at hand. Where a book has drawn from earlier works, it can be collated against those earlier works; where it has been cited by later works, it can be collated against those later works; where its historical materials are also recorded in contemporaneous works, it can be collated against those contemporaneous works.” (Chen, 1959: pp. 146-147) Therefore, these three works are collectively called external collation sources and discussed together.

6.1. Wencui Edition

The edition of the Wencui edition is the Ming Jiajing edition reproduced in *Sibu Congkan*. *Tang Wencui* should not be called an “edition” because *Tang Wencui* is not purely a collection of Chang Jian’s poems but only includes several poems. The abbreviation of *Wenyuan Yinghua* as “Yinghua edition” is similar.

1) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, the character 清 in “qing xi bu ke ce” appears as 青 in the Wencui edition. (Page 22)

2) In “Lament for General Wang’s Tomb”, the character 强 in “shen ru qiang qian li” appears as 强 in the Wencui edition. The compiled edition omitted this collation. (Page 187)

3) In “Inscribed at the Back Chan Cloister of Broken Mountain Monastery”, the character 钟 in “dan yu zhong qing yin” appears as 钟 in the Wencui edition. (Page 209)

4) In “Dreaming of the Western Peak of Mount Taibai”, the character 氛 in “yan lin bi yin yun” appears as 氛 in the Wencui edition. For the poem title, the table of contents at the beginning of the Wencui edition reads “Dreaming of the West of Mount Taibai Peak.” (Page 75)

6.2. Yinghua Edition

The edition of the Yinghua edition is the Ming Jiajing edition reproduced in *Sibu Congkan*. Collation errors in the compiled edition are as follows:

1) In “Qin Inspiration on the River”, for the character 阴 in “wan mu cheng you yin”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Yinghua edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 音.” Examining the Yinghua edition now, there is no such note. (Page 10)

2) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, the character 清 in “qing xi shen bu ce” appears as 青 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 22)

3) In “Lodging at Wang Changling’s Retreat”, the character 亭 in “mao ting su hua ying” appears as 庭 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 22)

4) In “Zhang the Taoist Recluse Playing the Qin”, the character 扣 in “gai xian kou shang sheng” appears as 和 in the Yinghua edition, with a note: “Alternative reading: 扣.” The compiled edition did not record the collation note. (Page 42)

5) In “In the Immortal Valley Meeting the Mao Maiden, Understanding She Was a Qin Palace Woman”, for the phrase 栝疎 in “song gua shu you feng”, the collation note states the Yinghua edition has a note: “Alternative reading: 柏疎.” Examining *Wenyuan Yinghua* now, it actually reads 栝疎. (Page 66)

6) In “In the Immortal Valley Meeting the Mao Maiden, Understanding She Was a Qin Palace Woman”, the character 女 in “shui bian yi shen nü” appears as 人 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 66)

7) In “Tomb of Wang Zhaojun”, for the character 馱 in “wan li tuo huang jin”, the collation note states it originally read 駝 and was emended based on the Tang Poets edition and six other editions. Examining the Yinghua edition now, it also reads 馱 and should be added to the collation notes. (Page 178)

8) In “Song of Young Master Zhang”, the character 北 in “zhuan zhan gu jun xi hai bei” appears as 曲 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 205)

9) In “Inscribed at the Back Chan Cloister of Broken Mountain Monastery”, the character 钟 in “dan yu zhong qing yin” appears as 钟 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 209)

10) In “Seeing Off Yuwen Liu”, the character 枝 in “wei feng lin li yi zhi qing” appears as 花 in the Yinghua edition. (Page 262)

6.3. Quan Edition

The edition of the Quan edition is the Qing Yangzhou Poetry Bureau edition reproduced by Shanghai Guji Publishing House. The abbreviation “Quan edition” is inappropriate; it should be directly called *Complete Tang Poems*. Its errors are as follows:

1) For the poem title of “Yan Dwelling”, *Complete Tang Poems* reads “燕居”. (Page 260)

2) In “Mountain Gibbons”, for the phrase 裊裊 in “yao yao niaoniao qing qie qie”, the compiled edition’s collation note states the Quan edition has a note: “Alternative readings: 淒淒, 依依.” Examining the notes in *Complete Tang Poems* now, it actually reads 淒淒, not 淒淒. (Page 277)

7. Conclusion

One of the most critical principles outlined in the book’s prefatory rules—previ-

ously cited as “whenever the base text differs from any collated edition, the variant shall invariably be recorded in the apparatus”—must, in light of the foregoing discussion, be regarded as only partially reliable and not wholly trustworthy. The book *Collected and Annotated Poems of Chang Jian* collates textual differences but does not distinguish right from wrong. Having now examined nine of the fourteen editions it collated, I have found over one hundred errors in total. Among the various types of errors, erroneous collation is the most prevalent (including instances of unwarranted alterations to character forms), followed by omissions in collation. The root causes lie primarily in an imperfect editorial framework and a lack of rigorous attention. Thus, its recorded textual differences are themselves deficient in verification and can hardly be called a reliable edition. Is this not what is meant by “ancient books become more erroneous with each reprinting”? However, collating books is like dusting and sweeping leaves—perfection is difficult to achieve. Observing its collation of *Complete Tang Poems* and the movable-type edition, which have only minor errors, one can also see. Using this book’s collation as an example, we find that rigorous textual criticism demands above all a meticulous attitude, specialized knowledge, and sound judgment, compelling us to engage in continual reflection, questioning, and verification.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

References

- Chen, Y. (1959). *Principles of Collation* (pp. 146-147). Zhonghua Book Company.
- Chen, Y. (2010). Principles of Collation. In Z. C. Chen (Ed.), *The Complete Works of Chen Yuan* (Volume 7, pp. 309-314). Anhui University Press.
- Ji, Y. et al. (2019). *General Catalogue of the Wuying Palace Edition of the Complete Library of the Four Branches*. National Library Publishing House.
- Peng, D. (1960). *Complete Tang Poetry*. Zhonghua Book Company.
- Peng, Y. et al. (2002). Tianlu Linlang Bibliography, Later Edition (Volume 6, Changsha Wang’s Edition (Guangxu 10th Year, Qing Dynasty)). In T. L. Gu & X. C. Fu (Ed.), *Continuation of the Complete Library of the Four Branches* (Volume 917, pp. 197-198). Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House.
- Palace Museum (1931). *Tianlu Linlang Series* (Volume 1, “Xu li”, p.3), Palace Museum.
- Tong, P. (1996). *A Study of Duplications and Errors in the Complete Tang Poetry* (p. 108). Shaanxi People’s Publishing House.
- Wang, X. (2017). *Annotations and Collation of Chang Jian’s Poetry* (p. 2). Zhonghua Book Company.
- Xu, Y. (2014). *Explanations and Examples of Ancient Book Collation* (Revised and Expanded Edition). Zhonghua Book Company.
- Ye, D. (1957) *Ten Principles of Book Collecting: On Collation, Rule Seven* (p.50). Classical Literature Press.